

HFEA Executive Licensing Panel Meeting

24 April 2014

Finsbury Tower, 103-105 Bunhill Row, London, EC1Y 8HF

Minutes – Item 9

Centre 0067 – (St Mary’s Hospital) – Executive Update on Success Rates

Members of the Panel:	Committee Secretary:
Juliet Tizzard – Interim Director of Strategy (Chair)	Dee Knoyle
David Moysen – Head of IT	
Joanne Anton – Policy Manager	

Declarations of Interest: members of the Panel declared that they had no conflicts of interest in relation to this item.

The Panel had before it:

- HFEA Protocol for the Conduct of Meetings of Executive Licensing Panel
- 8th edition of the HFEA Code of Practice
- Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (as amended)
- Decision trees for granting and renewing licences and considering requests to vary a licence (including the PGD decision tree)
- Guidance for members of Authority and Committees on the handling of conflicts of interest approved by the Authority on 21 January 2009.
- Guidance on periods for which new or renewed licences should be granted
- Standing Orders and Instrument of Delegation
- Indicative Sanctions Guidance
- HFEA Direction 0008 (where relevant), and any other relevant Directions issued by the Authority
- Guide to Licensing
- Compliance and Enforcement Policy
- Policy on Publication of Authority and Committee Papers

Consideration of Application

1. The Panel considered the papers, which included an Executive Update on success rates and licensing minutes for the past three years.

Background

2. The Executive Licensing Panel considered the renewal inspection report for centre 0067 in February 2012. The centre only provides NHS funded treatment. At that time, clinical pregnancy rates following IVF and ICSI in patients aged less than 38 years were lower than average at a statistically significant level, which had been a concern at the centre since 2007. Upon renewal, the centre was implementing a 'live birth improvement strategy' with the aim of improving IVF and ICSI success rates.
3. At the interim inspection in January 2013, HFEA-held register data for the year ending 30 September 2012 indicated no improvement in the centre's success rates in terms of clinical pregnancy, compared to the previous year. Success rates were in line with national averages with the following exceptions:
 - clinical pregnancy rates following IVF in patients aged less than 38 years were lower than average at a statistically significant level;
 - clinical pregnancy rates following ICSI in patients aged less than 38 years were lower than average at a statistically significant level;
 - clinical pregnancy rates following ICSI in patients aged 38 years and above were lower than average at a statistically significant level.
4. The centre's IVF and ICSI success rates were discussed at length in the course of the interim inspection and a suite of information documenting changes implemented since the last inspection and the analysis of recent success rates was provided. This documentation provided evidence that the centre had been proactive in implementing the following:
 - a revised ovarian stimulation protocol (implemented in April 2012);
 - fresh embryo transfers conducted in afternoons to maximise opportunities for embryo selection (the longer embryos are left to develop in vitro, the greater the opportunity to distinguish those developing normally);
 - consultant led embryo transfers (implemented in August 2012);
 - introduction of changes to the process for embryo transfer (implemented in September 2012);

- a review of the single embryo transfer programme and introduction of a revised multiple births minimisation policy (implemented in December 2012).
5. At the time of the interim inspection, it was acknowledged that the implementation of the 'live birth improvement strategy' had not yet had a demonstrable impact on the centre's success rates. The Executive Licensing Panel agreed that they should be provided with an update in relation to the centre's success rates in April 2014 or sooner if there was a significant downward trend in success rates before that time.

Update

6. The Panel noted that for the year ending 30 November 2013, current HFEA-held register data showed that the centre's success rates in terms of clinical pregnancy were in line with national averages in the following categories:
- donor insemination;
 - IVF in patients aged less than 38 years;
 - IVF in patients aged 38 years and above;
 - ICSI in patients aged 38 years and above;
 - Frozen embryo transfers in patients aged less than 40 years;
 - Frozen embryo transfers in patients aged 40 years and above.
7. The Panel noted that the only category in which clinical pregnancy rates are lower than the national average at a statistically significant level is ICSI in patients aged less than 38 years. Further analysis demonstrates that success rates were stable from December 2012 to April 2013, fell somewhat during May and June 2013, but have stabilised since that time. The poorer success rates during May and June 2013 had reduced the centre's average clinical pregnancy rate for the period 1 December 2012 – 30 November 2013.
8. The Panel noted that the Person Responsible (PR) had taken steps to improve the centre's success rates which appeared to be taking effect. The Panel noted that the Inspectorate will continue to monitor the centre's success rates and their recommendation that no further regulatory action in relation to success rates would be proportionate at this time.

Decision

9. The Panel were encouraged by the impact of the centre's 'live birth improvement strategy' to improve IVF and ICSI success rates and agreed with the Inspectorate's recommendation that no further regulatory action in relation to success rates would be proportionate at this time.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Juliet Tizzard', with a large loop at the end.

Signed:
Juliet Tizzard (Chair)

Date: 8 May 2014