

HFEA Licence Committee Meeting

26 April 2012

Finsbury Tower, 103-105 Bunhill Row, London, EC1Y 8HF

Minutes – Item 5

Centre 0049 (IVF Wales) – Follow up incident inspection report

Members of the Committee:	Committee Secretary:
David Archard (lay) Chair	Joanne McAlpine
Anna Carragher (lay)	
Rebekah Dundas (lay) (videoconference)	Legal Adviser:
Mair Crouch (lay)	Stephen Hocking, Partner, Public
Sue Price (professional)	Law Department
Jane Dibblin (lay)	For Beachcroft LLP

Declarations of Interest: Debbie Barber declared that she had a conflict with this item as her boss had provided comments to the report. Other members of the Committee declared that they had no conflicts of interest in relation to this item.

The following papers were considered by the Committee

- Follow up Incident Inspection Report
- Research Licence Committee Minutes Representations -dated 15/12/2011
- Licence Committee Minutes – Incident Inspection dated 20/10/2011
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Variation to change the Person Responsible dated 04/06/2011
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Variation to change the Licence Holder dated 20/10/2010
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Renewal inspection report dated 15/07/2010
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Variation to change Licence Holder dated 24/02/2010
- Licence Committee Minutes – Breach of Licence Conditions dated 03/12/2009
- Licence Committee Minutes – Interim Inspection Report dated 10/06/2009
- Licence Committee Minutes – Incident Report dated 28/01/2008

The Committee also had before it

- HFEA Protocol for the Conduct of Licence Committee Meetings and Hearings
- 8th edition of the HFEA Code of Practice
- Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (as amended)
- Decision trees for granting and renewing licences and considering requests to vary a licence (including the PGD decision tree); and
- Guidance for members of Authority and Committees on the handling of conflicts of interest approved by the Authority on 21 January 2009.
- Guidance on periods for which new or renewed licences should be granted
- Standing Orders and Instrument of Delegation
- Indicative Sanctions Guidance
- HFEA Directions 0000 – 0012
- Guide to Licensing
- Compliance and Enforcement Policy
- Policy on Publication of Authority and Committee Papers
- HFEA Pre-Implantation Diagnostic Testing (“PGD”) Explanatory Note For Licence Committee

Discussion

1. The Committee noted the background to this report and that two incidents were reported by the centre in April and May 2011 and whilst gathering information prior to the incident inspection it was noted the centre’s success rates had significantly decreased. It was therefore decided to incorporate concerns regarding this and recent staffing issues as further areas to be explored as part of an incident inspection on 15 June 2011.
2. The Committee noted that a new application was received by the Executive for a new Person Responsible (PR) and this had been approved by the Executive Licensing Panel on 24 June 2011.
3. The Committee noted that the report of the incident inspection was considered by this Licence Committee on 20 October 2011 when a condition was added to the centre’s licence.
4. The Committee noted that representations were made by the PR following the Licence Committee on 20 October 2011 against the wording of the additional condition imposed on the centre’s licence. The Committee noted that on 15 December 2011, the PR’s representations were upheld

by the Licence Committee and the wording of the additional condition imposed on the centre's licence was changed.

5. The Committee noted that at the time of the follow up inspection on 20 January 2012 the Inspectorate were satisfied that the PR was able to provide evidence that all the recommendations in the previous inspection report have been complied with or are in the process of being complied with, as work on some corrective actions is on-going.
6. The Committee noted the substantial amount of work by the new PR, the acting head of embryology and the other centre staff to implement the recommendations.
7. The Committee would encourage the centre to continue to work closely with the Inspectorate to implement any recommendations that remain outstanding and would urge the centre to consider implementing a buddying system.
8. The Committee noted the follow up report and endorsed the recommendation of the Inspectorate that the centre's licence should continue without removing the additional condition. This endorsement is without prejudging the renewal of the centre's licence which will be considered in the usual course of Authority business.

Signed:

Date: 10/05/2012



David Archard (Chair)

HFEA Licence Committee Meeting

26 April 2012

Finsbury Tower, 103-105 Bunhill Row, London, EC1Y 8HF

Minutes – Item 5

Centre 0049 (IVF Wales) – Follow up incident inspection report

Members of the Committee:	Committee Secretary:
David Archard (lay) Chair	Joanne McAlpine
Anna Carragher (lay)	
Rebekah Dundas (lay) (videoconference)	Legal Adviser:
Mair Crouch (lay)	Stephen Hocking, Partner, Public
Sue Price (professional)	Law Department
Jane Dibblin (lay)	For Beachcroft LLP

Declarations of Interest: Debbie Barber declared that she had a conflict with this item as her boss had provided comments to the report. Other members of the Committee declared that they had no conflicts of interest in relation to this item.

The following papers were considered by the Committee

- Follow up Incident Inspection Report
- Research Licence Committee Minutes Representations -dated 15/12/2011
- Licence Committee Minutes – Incident Inspection dated 20/10/2011
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Variation to change the Person Responsible dated 04/06/2011
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Variation to change the Licence Holder dated 20/10/2010
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Renewal inspection report dated 15/07/2010
- Executive Licensing Panel Minutes – Variation to change Licence Holder dated 24/02/2010
- Licence Committee Minutes – Breach of Licence Conditions dated 03/12/2009
- Licence Committee Minutes – Interim Inspection Report dated 10/06/2009
- Licence Committee Minutes – Incident Report dated 28/01/2008

The Committee also had before it

- HFEA Protocol for the Conduct of Licence Committee Meetings and Hearings
- 8th edition of the HFEA Code of Practice
- Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (as amended)
- Decision trees for granting and renewing licences and considering requests to vary a licence (including the PGD decision tree); and
- Guidance for members of Authority and Committees on the handling of conflicts of interest approved by the Authority on 21 January 2009.
- Guidance on periods for which new or renewed licences should be granted
- Standing Orders and Instrument of Delegation
- Indicative Sanctions Guidance
- HFEA Directions 0000 – 0012
- Guide to Licensing
- Compliance and Enforcement Policy
- Policy on Publication of Authority and Committee Papers
- HFEA Pre-Implantation Diagnostic Testing (“PGD”) Explanatory Note For Licence Committee

Discussion

1. The Committee noted the background to this report and that two incidents were reported by the centre in April and May 2011 and whilst gathering information prior to the incident inspection it was noted the centre’s success rates had significantly decreased. It was therefore decided to incorporate concerns regarding this and recent staffing issues as further areas to be explored as part of an incident inspection on 15 June 2011.
2. The Committee noted that a new application was received by the Executive for a new Person Responsible (PR) and this had been approved by the Executive Licensing Panel on 24 June 2011.
3. The Committee noted that the report of the incident inspection was considered by this Licence Committee on 20 October 2011 when a condition was added to the centre’s licence.
4. The Committee noted that representations were made by the PR following the Licence Committee on 20 October 2011 against the wording of the additional condition imposed on the centre’s licence. The Committee noted that on 15 December 2011, the PR’s representations were upheld

by the Licence Committee and the wording of the additional condition imposed on the centre's licence was changed.

5. The Committee noted that at the time of the follow up inspection on 20 January 2012 the Inspectorate were satisfied that the PR was able to provide evidence that all the recommendations in the previous inspection report have been complied with or are in the process of being complied with, as work on some corrective actions is on-going.
6. The Committee noted the substantial amount of work by the new PR, the acting head of embryology and the other centre staff to implement the recommendations.
7. The Committee would encourage the centre to continue to work closely with the Inspectorate to implement any recommendations that remain outstanding and would urge the centre to consider implementing a buddying system.
8. The Committee noted the follow up report and endorsed the recommendation of the Inspectorate that the centre's licence should continue without removing the additional condition. This endorsement is without prejudging the renewal of the centre's licence which will be considered in the usual course of Authority business.

Signed:

Date: 10/05/2012



David Archard (Chair)